



Munich Personal RePEc Archive

# **Exploring the Factors Enabling Old Lahore's Traditional Markets to Resist WCLA'S Preservation Efforts**

Javed, Umair and Najmi, Muhammad Shahwali and Haroon,  
Muhammad Hasaan and Ahmed, Hiba

Lahore University of Management Sciences

18 December 2024

Online at <https://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/125337/>  
MPRA Paper No. 125337, posted 15 Jul 2025 09:22 UTC



# **EXPLORING THE FACTORS ENABLING OLD LAHORE'S TRADITIONAL MARKETS TO RESIST WCLA'S PRESERVATION EFFORTS**



DR UMAIR JAVED  
M. SHAWALI NAJMI  
M.HASAAN HAROON  
HIBA AHMED

## **Section 1: Introduction**

Old Lahore traditional markets play a prime place in the city's identity by reflecting the practices and customs over generations. The markets represent far more than a commercial center, since they embody the dynamic interaction of cultural values and historical practice. As Geertz would write, "markets are webs of economic relationships" and are also the depositories of social and cultural values (Geertz).

The operations of these markets are characterized by their crude trading practices, the nature of products sold, and the personalized relationships between traders and customers, which have remained relatively unchanged with time. This research is interdisciplinary, combining sociology, anthropology, history, heritage, and economics to analyze the relationship between heritage conservation efforts and the continuity of traditional market practices.

The Walled City of Lahore Authority (WCLA) has initiated preservation efforts to safeguard the historical and architectural significance of these markets. However, these initiatives often encounter resistance from market participants. This resistance stems from a complex interplay of internal factors—such as self-regulating mechanisms and stable vendor relationships—and external forces like socio-economic pressures, political dynamics, and policy decisions. Given that Rotblat conceptualizes the bazaar as a complex social and economic unit (Rotblat) and Keshavarzian defines the political economy of the bazaar, the study explores how these bazaars manage to respond to the conservation pressures without losing their traditional character.

In Anila Naeem's work on resistance to heritage designation in Sindh, comparative insights further contextualize the socio-political and economic dynamics of influence in Old Lahore's markets (Naeem). Likewise, Mughal observes that resistance to heritage preservation arises from the complex interplay of historical, cultural, and economic factors and emphasizes the need for nuanced approaches (Mughal).

### **Purpose Statement**

The aim of this paper is to study the traditional markets of Old Lahore in terms of their role as dynamic socio-economic spaces and their ability to resist efforts to preserve heritage by the Walled City of Lahore Authority (WCLA). Through research on the internal dynamics of these markets and external socio-political and economic pressures, a

comprehensive understanding of the factors that will enable these markets to retain traditional practices in the face of conservations is expected.

**Specifically, the paper discusses:**

- The characteristics and mechanisms of traditional markets, including trading systems, vendor networks, and forms of informal management.
- Internal and external factors that shape the resilience of markets, as elaborated by Rotblat and Keshavarzian, among others.
- The social-political and economic dynamics shaping relations between preservation efforts and traditional practices in markets, contextualized through comparative examples such as Naeem's study on Sindh.

This is an interdisciplinary approach directed toward informing policy decisions and strategies in heritage conservation, ensuring the sustainable development of traditional markets while their cultural and historical essence should be respected.

**Problem Statement:**

Heritage preservation efforts by the Walled City of Lahore Authority (WCLA) put pressure on traditional markets in Old Lahore. This might not be in the direct interests of the people who preserve such spaces, but the activities have a direct impact on them because the self-regulating systems and informal practices that define such markets often clash with heritage preservation. Thus, resistance appears based on the need to conserve the traditional trading methods and relationships between vendors and socio-cultural values embedded in such markets.

As Mughal describes resistance to heritage preservation comes from the intricate historical, cultural, and economic relationships (Mughal). Thus, market dynamics inside the household—like stable vendor networks, personal relations—meet forces from the outside, like policy-making decisions, economic changes, or more broadly, socio-political contexts. These forces give an outline of Rotblat's description of the bazaar as a social-economic unit.

As Naeem's work on resistance to heritage designation in Sindh reveals, the preservation outcome is significantly affected by the socio-political dynamics of the situation (Naeem). Keshavarzian's idea of the political economy of the bazaar, too, speaks about the local and regional politics influencing the market resilience (Keshavarzian).

This research addresses that gap in understanding how traditional markets in Old Lahore navigate these challenges in terms of strategies that market participants employ to balance heritage preservation efforts with the continued practice of their traditional ways. Of great importance is this kind of knowledge in designing policies on preservation that respect and integrate into socio-economic and cultural dimensions of historic marketplaces.

## **Section 2: Literature Review**

### **Understanding the Walled City Lahore Authority**

The conservation efforts spearheaded by the Walled City Lahore Authority (WCLA) are praised for protecting historical cultural heritage; however, others criticize them for disrupting the very fabric of the economic and social Fibers of the historic bazaars. It is here that these old marketplaces, hence an integral part of the city's fabric, face problems with the restrictions and processes involved in removing encroachments.

To better understand their importance, we can look at the work of Harry John Stone who writes, “The Walled City became Lahore’s commercial heart: a dense maze of alleyways and markets, whose karkhana (workshops) thronged with thousands of weavers, ironsmiths, masons, miniaturists, astrolabe makers, jewellers, cobblers and carpet weavers. Together they sustained imperial trade and supplied a burgeoning society with their material needs.” This has been hindered by conservation efforts by state authorities and have led to their numbers drastically reducing.

One of the key issues is the relocation of traders and the aim of removing “the encroachment of various unregulated elements on the city's fabric” (Kron), which while aimed at restoring historic sites, has created friction with the commercial activities of the bazaars. The WCLA's focus on restoring structures, such as the city gates and historic landmarks, often involves vacating areas of traders who rely on these spaces for their livelihood. For Example, “PEPAC's proposal involves the relocation of the steel traders (whom it claims are operating illegally) to a more suitable location and repopulating the area with a mixture of commercial and residential uses” (Kron). Projects like the re-development of the Delhi Gate and its environs with the Lahore Fort have dislodged businesses that, in turn, have affected pedestrian flows and daily commercial operations in adjacent bazaars.

The conservation authority of the Walled City holds the view that, “Commerce has expanded like a cancer and eaten into the historic fabric” (Punjab Heritage). While the intent

is to preserve the historic aesthetic and improve urban management, measures to that extent may tend to restrict old traditional functioning of such markets. Sometimes, the relocation of traders or adjustment to new restrictions undermines their business models, and on the economic realities concerning small businesses dependent on these spaces, there may build a kind of tension between heritage conservation goals.

In "Conservation-Led Marginalization: Making Heritage in the Walled City of Lahore", the author critically examines how conservation efforts prioritize tourism, leading to the marginalization of local communities. She labels this as, "an underlying dichotomy" (Sohail 7). Sohail argues that these initiatives, often driven by international organizations and government bodies, commodify heritage for economic gain, sidelining the needs of the local population. She acknowledges that, "The role of the informal sector as sources of employment and economic activity has been acknowledged as integral to the cities of developing countries" (Sohail 18). Displacement of traders and changes to social dynamics disrupt the traditional marketplaces, such as the bazaars, impacting livelihoods and eroding the cultural vibrancy of these spaces.

Similarly, in "Urban Heritage of the Walled City of Lahore: Critical Analysis and the Way Forward for Policy", Ayesha Pamela Rogers and Aasim Akhtar (2021) analyse how a project-based approach to conservation creates economic pressures on the bazaars by displacing local businesses. The project-based approach leaves out the real targeted low-income group and proves to be of little success. They writers discuss how the Walled City of Lahore, the traditional markets or bazaars have also undergone transformations due to these conservation efforts, affecting the commercial activities vital to the local economy (Akhtar et al).

## **Understanding Bazaars Around the World**

In *The Bazaar Economy: Information and Search in Peasant Marketing*, Clifford Geertz examines bazaars as intricate systems of economic and social exchanges rooted in personalized relationships and localized knowledge. Geertz describes bazaars as spatially localized, with a division of Labor and intensive bargaining, where trust-based "clientelization" reduces uncertainty in environments where "information is poor, scarce, maldistributed, [and] inefficiently communicated" (Geertz 29). This framework applies to Old Lahore's markets, where traders rely on informal networks and localized knowledge. Preservation efforts by the WCLA disrupt these internal mechanisms, as Geertz argues that

bazaar economies resist external regulation, relying instead on "personal confrontation between intimate antagonists" during transactions (Geertz 30). Such systems, adaptive and self-sustaining, struggle against commodification for tourism or modernization.

In *Bazaar and State in Iran*, Keshavarzian views bazaars as socio-political units with significant autonomy. He highlights how Tehran Bazaar resisted Shah-era modernization policies by mobilizing collective action, controlling two-thirds of Iran's wholesale trade and 30% of imports in the 1960s and 1970s (Alizadeh 527). Post-1979, intensified state interventions undermined its autonomy through "draconian regulatory systems" (Alizadeh 528). Keshavarzian emphasizes bazaars' ability to navigate political and economic pressures while safeguarding traditions, a dynamic mirrored in Old Lahore. Here, vendors rely on selfregulation, informal credit, and networked trade. Disruptions by the WCLA threaten their autonomy, prompting resistance. Like Tehran, small reforms in Old Lahore often meet trader opposition, and only systemic changes could address these challenges (Alizadeh 529).

Mazaheri, in *An Informal Revolution: State-Business Conflict and Institutional Change in Iran*, examines how state modernization marginalizes informal markets by disrupting pre-existing norms. He highlights how Shah-era industrialization undermined the bazaar's informal credit systems, its "lifeblood" (Mazaheri 590). Mazaheri argues that attempts to formalize or commodify traditional markets displace traders, clashing with norms of trust, reputation, and autonomy (Mazaheri 593). This analysis applies directly to Old Lahore, where WCLA interventions disrupt informal practices, threatening livelihoods, and cultural continuity. Mazaheri's work underscores the tension between institutional modernization and the resilience of informal systems.

## **Understanding the Bazaars of Lahore**

Mohammad Rafique Mughal's work on the preservation of heritage in Pakistan traces its evolution from British-era frameworks to contemporary practices. The British period of preservation focused on documentation rather than physical conservation, formalized under the Ancient Monuments Preservation Act of 1904. Post-independence, Pakistan modernized this framework through the Antiquities Act of 1968, extending its scope to movable objects and defining 'antique' (Mughal 8). As a signatory to international conventions such as the Venice Charter of 1964, Pakistan is expected to follow global standards focusing on the integrity of cultural properties. However, implementation often fails due to administrative, technical, and financial constraints (Mughal 10).

This analysis relates to the challenges of preserving Old Lahore, particularly regarding the WCLA's efforts to balance heritage conservation with the economic realities of traditional markets. Traders and local communities often resist interventions that affect livelihoods, reflecting similar administrative and financial constraints identified by Mughal (Mughal 12).

Integrated conservation efforts at the Bibi Jawandi Monument Complex in Uch Sharif highlight the importance of safeguarding historical, artistic, and cultural value. These efforts include site evaluation, structural stabilization, and management planning while accommodating religious and public use (Cheema and Bell 350). Challenges include intermittent funding, site degradation, and heavy pedestrian traffic that erodes pathways and weakens foundations. Issues such as vandalism and theft of architectural elements further compromise authenticity. Conservation strategies involve infrastructural improvements, community engagement, and sensitive architectural interventions, but sporadic funding delays critical restoration activities (Cheema and Bell 355).

The Bibi Jawandi case exemplifies the need for sustainable funding and community engagement in heritage conservation. These lessons are directly applicable to Old Lahore, where the WCLA must collaborate with the community to address conservation challenges without harming existing practices. Inclusive, community-led approaches are essential for preserving the historical and cultural integrity of Old Lahore's markets while ensuring economic sustainability.

### **Section 3: Research Question**

What features of the traditional markets in Old Lahore enable resistance to the Walled City Lahore Authority's (WCLA) preservation efforts? What are the key socio-economic and political factors that influence this resistance?

#### **Aims of the Research:**

- To explore the traditional functioning of these markets that enable them to resist preservation efforts by the Walled City of Lahore Authority (WCLA).
- To understand the broader implications of this resistance to the cultural heritage and traditional livelihoods within Old Lahore.



- To identify and understand the internal factors (inherent characteristics and selfregulating systems) and external factors (socio-economic and political contexts) that affect the markets' ability to sustain their traditional essence.
- To offer insights that can inform policy decisions, guide preservation efforts, and contribute to sustainable development of the markets.

## **Section 4: Research Method**

This study employs the qualitative approach to explore how the dynamics of traditional markets in Old Lahore come about. The methods rely on engagement with stakeholders, including shop owners, towards an understanding of market functioning, problems, and time factors shaping these spaces.

### **Study area**

This study will focus on the traditional markets of Old Lahore, those that are famous for their cultural vigor, historical importance, and intricate social networks. Markets make for an ideal focus, representing a unique blend of commerce and community, to understand the interplay between economic activity and cultural preservation.

It talks about the role of the Walled City of Lahore Authority in the management and conservation of such spaces. It is an important dimension of the study that unfolds how heritage and modern demands converge at an urban level. Surveys were conducted of people from Azam Market, Akbari Mandi, Kashmiri and Lohari Gate.

### **Unit of analysis**

The study focuses on two core groups:

**Market Shop owners:** It will interview shop owners so that one can record their practices, difficulties, and views of how the market environment has changed.

**Stakeholders:** It would be a very in-depth interview with those people who, one way or another, govern or culturally manage these markets- that is, the WCLA officials and community leaders.

### **Methods and Rationale**

The data of this research are collected through both survey and interview methods.

### **Surveys of Shop owners**

It was conducted to collect quantitative and qualitative data on market operations, challenges in markets being faced by shop owners, and their views about changes in Old Lahore's market dynamics.

**Approach:** Structured surveys would record details of daily business practice, interaction with customers, and broader socio-economic factors affecting livelihoods.

### **Stakeholder Interviews**

**Purpose:** To place market governance, preservation efforts, and the socio-economic importance of such spaces in a broader perspective. Interviews of WCLA officials, local leaders, and other members concerned will be conducted.

**Focus Areas:** There are some key areas under focus, such as role of policies in market management, cultural preservation programs, and challenges associated with heritage conservation against modern needs.

## **Section 5: Ethics and Limitations**

This study adheres to ethical research principles, including the protection of participant confidentiality and obtaining informed consent where applicable. All data used were collected and analyzed in compliance with institutional and legal standards, ensuring transparency and integrity in the research process.

This study has various limitations. These include a possibility of bias in methods used for data collection, generalized results to other contexts beyond what is being investigated, and secondary sources of data might contain inaccuracies or even gaps. Additionally, unobserved policy changes and economic conditions outside the study may influence the results. Therefore, these constraints are considered in interpreting the results.

## **Section 6: Findings**

### **1. Walled City of Lahore Authority (WCLA) Perspective**

The WCLA introduces itself as an active and leading institution working on the preservation and conservation of heritage sites within the Walled City of Lahore. In their interview, they emphasized the following points:

#### **Institutional Role:**

The WCLA described itself as the most competent heritage conservation institution in Lahore. They said that they were a very efficient authority working actively "in every corner of the Walled City" to preserve the culture and historical landmarks.

#### **Stakeholder Engagement:**

WCLA members said that they are in active collaboration with all relevant stakeholders, including local shopkeepers, residents, and governmental authorities to ensure that heritage preservation is holistic and sensitive to the reality on the ground.

#### **Commitment to Heritage:**

WCLA claimed that they are very committed to protecting the cultural and historical value of Walled City, saying that their projects strike a balance between preserving the area and ensuring economic and social activity is kept in these areas.

#### **Conservation Efforts Coverage:**

WCLA claims that its projects cut across different parts of the Walled City, thereby indicating that the coverage of the projects is vast. While WCLA's narrative tells a story of an optimistic approach to their work, on-ground realities as narrated by shop owners offer contrasting narratives.

### **2. Shopkeepers' Perspective**

#### **Absence of Authorities:**

The shopkeepers' interview, especially with one shop owner in particular, brought out stark contrasts to WCLA's declarations and on-ground issues in the traditional markets of Old Lahore. Shopkeepers unanimously assert that WCLA does not exist in their markets. They contradict the authority's assertion of widespread engagement as the shop owners believe that the activities of WCLA are merely confined to the most highlighted areas such as tourist icons. The shop owner said: "They have only preserved those areas that bring tourist revenue like Wazir Khan Mosque. Such markets don't have any interest in them as no tourists visit here." WCLA is seen as an "intrusive authority". Shopkeepers perceived WCLA as suspicious, saying they "won't let them work here" because their interventions disrupt businesses and exert external control.

#### **Poor Market Conditions:**

Shopkeepers described the gross structural and infrastructural anomalies in traditional markets, depicting a chasm between WCLA's assertions and the reality on the ground:

- Streets are in deplorable condition with no maintenance or infrastructural development.
- Wiring is hazardous with "open wires" posing serious safety hazards.
- Shopkeepers drew attention to the lack of fire safety measures: "If there's a fire, no fire extinguisher can come in."

This is both a result of poor planning and neglect, which threatens the safety of both businesses and visitors. The shop owner noted that modernization is taking place at the markets' entrance, where large plazas are replacing the old structures. This uncontrolled modernization is against WCLA's conservation objectives.

#### **Structural Weaknesses in Union Governance:**

The shopkeeper noted that unions, which have been responsible for the past for the interest of traders, are weak and underfunded. The weakness of the union does not allow effective action on urgent issues such as infrastructure, fire safety, and market preservation. The shopkeeper suggested a solution, "WCLA can provide funds to unions, and unions can work for conservation efforts." This approach suggests that the need is for joint ventures rather than WCLA direct intervention, which traders consider as being heavy-handed and disruptive.

#### **Political and Social Dynamics:**

Shopkeepers pointed out the political aspect of the conservation effort:

- The government does not enforce their policies of conservation because Old Lahore is a big vote bank. Political sensitivity puts restraints on the very action that could cause hassle for the locals.
- Shopkeepers believe their market problems are deep rooted and will not improve much unless there are collective efforts made.
- As one shopkeeper said, "Markets have been the way they are for centuries. And they will remain so for years to come."

#### **Conclusion**

A jarring disconnection emerges between the institutional narrative that WCLA projects and on-ground realities faced by shopkeepers in Old Lahore markets. While WCLA emphasizes considerable efforts and stakeholder coordination, shopkeepers complain that:

- WCLA is confined only to tourist-focused areas without dealing with critical issues prevailing in the markets.
- Traders object to direct interventions from WCLA as they believe WCLA is disrupting them and lacks trust.
- Market unions, weak though they are, would still be useful as intermediate forces to bring about necessary change.

This requires a collaborative, trust-based approach where WCLA can work with market unions and local stakeholders to balance the preservation of heritage with the socioeconomic needs of traders. Without such efforts, it is unlikely that the entrenched problems of infrastructure, modernization, and governance issues will be resolved.



**The Kahsmiri Gate**



**Modernization Amidst the History**

### **3. Survey Results**

#### **Demographics and Business Background:**

The demographic statistics showed that a majority of the shopkeepers are aged, with most of them within the 41-50 and 51 and above age groups. This reflects that Old Lahore's markets are mostly run by experienced traders, most of whom have inherited their business

from past generations. A considerable number of shopkeepers reported their business as a family trade, which underscores the fact that these markets are carried out over generations. There are markets like the oil market, metal market, cloth market, and so on, which are very traditional. The shopkeepers maintain long-term relationships within their trades.

This demographic structure is pertinent to our project as it emphasizes the deep historical roots and social ties that are part of Old Lahore's traditional markets. These businesses have been a part of the socio-economic landscape for generations, which makes them resilient and resistant to external interventions.

### **Social Relations and Community Dynamics:**

The survey results clearly indicate that social relationships are a characteristic of these markets. Shopkeepers reported them being "very closely connected" with their peers, describing relationships as friendly, cooperative, but competitive. Such relationships create a climate of trust and interdependence, where shopkeepers rely on each other for support, common suppliers, and trade information. Social networks of the suppliers are primarily long-term based on trust. Trust is the underlying determinant in maintaining smooth business operations. These markets are interconnected, in an almost similar way, with Clifford Geertz's idea about bazaars, which says, "webs of economic and social relationships", that through personal ties, conduct, and information flow.

### **Role of Community and Trade Unions:**

Shopkeepers emphasized that their businesses play a social role in the community, as they are gathering places for local residents and contribute to the cultural fabric of Old Lahore. However, the shopkeepers complained about the weak role of trade unions. While unions are considered a possible solution to improving market conditions, they are currently underfunded and lack the resources to undertake significant development or preservation efforts. Many shopkeepers advised the government to finance unions so that they can spearhead grassroots improvement programs without compromising the market's dynamics. This is a clear indication that people demand WCLA, unions, and shopkeepers' collaboration with unions acting as trustworthy mediators in implementing the conservation and infrastructure projects.

**Challenges in the Market:** The shopkeepers complained about the following severe economic pressures:

- Increasing rent costs and competition from larger business entities.
- Poor infrastructure conditions, such as hazardous wiring, narrow and deteriorating streets, and the absence of emergency services like fire extinguishers.

Shopkeepers noticed that modernization is happening at the entrance of markets where big plazas and commercial buildings are under construction. This uncontrolled modernization is threatening the traditional market structures while WCLA is concentrating on high-tourism areas. The shopkeepers feel that their markets are being ignored because they do not attract tourists or generate direct revenue, unlike areas like Wazir Khan Mosque. This inconsistency brings out the imbalance in the conservation strategies and strengthens the opposition towards WCLA's perceived initiatives.

### **Robustness of Markets and Short-term Future**

Shopkeepers are proud of their markets' ages and resilience, which would survive the economic pressures and neglect. One shopkeeper stated, "Markets have been like this for centuries, and they will remain like this for years to come." This assertion reflects a strong belief that these markets function under self-regulating systems that resist external alterations. When shopkeepers were asked about what could be done to change the situation, they suggested that improvement requires joint efforts between unions, WCLA, and local authorities. Main suggestions include:

- Government funding for trade unions to strengthen their role in improving infrastructure and market conditions.
- WCLA acts as a facilitator rather than an authority figure, respecting the traditional structures of the market.
- Ensuring improvements do not disrupt business operations or alienate the shopkeepers.

### **Conclusion**

The findings show that shopkeeping in Old Lahore's conventional markets is based on networked social relations, which are necessary for business reproduction. However, the physical and economic challenges facing them are severe and become worse with the perceived absence of WCLA. While trade unions are considered the most effective bodies to drive change, they are poorly funded and frail. Shopkeepers suggest that the government and WCLA must partner with unions by funding such initiatives to help resolve issues in the

markets without jeopardizing the established order in these markets. The shopkeeper's argument is in line with the larger ideas of our project, such as market resistance, selfregulation, and the need to balance heritage values with socio-economic considerations.



**The state of Bazaars within the gates**  
**Section 7: Concluding Discussion**

Our findings expose a vast gulf between the WCLA's boastful declarations of heritage preservation as proactive measures and the real-life shopkeeper experiences in Old Lahore's traditional markets. Shopkeeper interviews and survey responses correlate closely with the literature on resistance to external intervention. Geertz's interpretation of bazaars as webs of social and economic relationships strongly resonates, since shopkeepers rely on long-standing personal networks, trust-based credit systems, and self-regulating mechanisms to sustain their businesses. Keshavarz Ian's understanding of the autonomy and political resilience of bazaars reflects shopkeepers' distrust of the WCLA, who they perceive as intrusive outsiders. Similarly, Mazaheri's argument that modernization and formalization disrupt informal systems finds validation, as unchecked construction of plazas at market entrances replaces heritage structures and destabilizes traditional practices.

Furthermore, the shopkeepers' concerns about corruption and the absence of preservation incentives reflect broader socio-political dynamics. They highlighted instances such as the plaza built next to Kashmiri Gate without any gap, damaging the heritage site—a development made possible by systemic corruption. This is exacerbated by the absence of tourist footfall and the government's hesitation to implement preservation policies, considering Old Lahore's potential as a vote bank, thus creating an environment in which the



conservation work goes down the priority list. As such, the markets are neglected, and the structural issues persist, hence highlighting the deep-rooted challenges that resist any meaningful preservation.

## Section 8: Works Cited

- Alizadeh, Parvin. "Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient," vol. 53, no. 3, 2010, pp. 527–29. JSTOR, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20789806> Accessed 17 Dec. 2024.
- Cheema, Y., and J.S. Bell. "Integrated Investigation, Assessment, Intervention Design, and Implementation as a Model for Conservation Practice." *Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites*, vol. 15, nos. 3-4, 2013, pp. 348–368.
- Geertz, Clifford. "The Bazaar Economy: Information and Search in Peasant Marketing." In *The Sociology of Economic Life*, edited by Mark Granovetter and Richard Swedberg, 3rd ed., Westview Press, 2018.
- Keshavarzian, Arang. *Bazaar and State in Iran: The Politics of the Tehran Marketplace*. Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Kron, Zachary M. *Conservation of the Urban Fabric: Walled City of Lahore, Pakistan*. MIT, 1996.
- Mazaheri, Nimah. "An 'Informal' Revolution: State-Business Conflict and Institutional Change in Iran." *Middle Eastern Studies*, vol. 44, no. 4, 2008, pp. 585–602. JSTOR, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40262597> Accessed 17 Dec. 2024.
- Mughal, Mohammad Rafique. "Heritage Preservation in Pakistan from National and International Perspectives." *Heritage Preservation: Safeguarding Our National Treasure*, 2010, pp. 1–25.
- Naeem, Anila. "Evolution and Repercussions of the Heritage Designation Process in Sindh, Pakistan: Lessons from Karachi and Shikarpur." In *The Routledge Handbook on Historic Urban Landscapes*, 2019.
- Naqvi, Ali. "Lahore Restoration Project Aims to Revive Old City's Lustre." *Punjab Heritage*, May 2024.
- Nawaz, M. Shafaat. "Urban Heritage of the Walled City of Lahore: Critical Analysis and the Way Forward for Policy." *Journal of Architectural and Planning Research*, vol. 36, no. 9, 2019, pp. 289–302.
- Rotblat, H.J. "Social Organization and Development in an Iranian Provincial Bazaar."

*Economic Development and Cultural Change*, vol. 23, no. 4, 1975, pp. 451–464.

Sohail, Jannat. "Conservation-Led Marginalization: Making Heritage in the Walled City of Lahore." *Urban Studies*, supervised by Maroš Krivý, 25 May 2020.

Stone, Harry Jhon. *The Artisans of the Walled City of Lahore*. Walled City of Lahore Authority, Aga Khan Trust for Culture, 24 June 2019.

## **Section 8B: Appendix**

## **Survey Design for Shopkeepers**

### **Section 1: Demographics and Business Background**

#### **1. Age of Shopkeeper**

- Below 20
- 2130
- 3140
- 4150
- 51 and above

#### **2. Gender**

- Male
- Female

#### **3. Market Type**

- Oil Market
- Metal Market
- Cloth Market
- Music Instrument Market
- Other (Please specify)

#### **4. Years in Business**

- Less than 5 years
- 510 years
- 1120 years

- More than 20 years

## 5. Family Background in the Market

Is this business part of a family trade passed down through generations?

- Yes (How many years \_\_\_\_\_)
- No

## Section 2: Social Relations and Community Dynamics

### 6. Connections with Other Shopkeepers

How well do you know other shopkeepers in this market?

- Very closely connected
- Acquainted
- Not very connected

Describe the nature of these connections (e.g., friendly, competitive, collaborative).

### 7. Collaboration with Peers

Do you collaborate with other shopkeepers on pricing, sourcing materials, or other aspects of business?

- Yes, frequently
- Sometimes
- No

Please specify the types of collaboration (e.g., shared suppliers, pooling funds for bulk purchases).

### 8. Social Networks with Suppliers

How do you interact with your suppliers?

- Long-term, trusted relationships
- Changing suppliers frequently
- Only business focused interactions

Describe any social or trust-based factors that play a role in these relationships.

## 9. Customer Relationships

Do you have regular customers who are loyal to your shop?

- Yes
- No

If yes, how do these relationships influence your business practices (e.g., offering discounts, payment flexibility)?

## 10. Community Role

Would you say your business plays a social role in the community (e.g., gathering spot, community support)?

- Yes, significant role
- Moderate role
- No specific role

Please elaborate on any social responsibilities or expectations from the community.

## 11. Family and Social Involvement in the Business

Is your family actively involved in running the shop?

- Yes

-  
No

Do social relationships (friends, relatives) impact your decision-making in the business? If yes, how?

### Section 3: Socio-economic Factors Influencing Business

#### 12. Economic Pressures

What economic factors most affect your business operations? (Rank in order from 1(Highest) to 5(Lowest) based on importance)

- Rising rent costs
- Competition from larger businesses
- Cost of materials
- Local taxes or tariffs
- Other (please specify)

#### 13. Income Variability

Do you experience seasonal or monthly variations in income?

- Yes, high variability
- Moderate variability
- Stable income

What factors influence these variations (e.g., festivals, tourism)?

#### 14. Support Networks in Times of Financial Difficulty

If you face economic hardships, do you receive support from:

- Family

-

- Fellow shopkeepers

#### Suppliers

- Financial institutions
- Other (please specify)

Describe any informal support systems that help during difficult times.

### 15. Credit and Financial Transactions

Do you offer credit to customers, or buy on credit from suppliers?

- Yes, regularly
- Occasionally
- No

How are these financial arrangements typically managed (e.g., trust based, formal agreements)?

### Section 4: Perspectives on WCLA's Preservation Efforts and Social Impact

### 16. Awareness and Perception of WCLA Initiatives

Are you familiar with WCLA's initiatives in your market?

- Yes, very familiar
- Somewhat familiar
- Not familiar

How do you feel these initiatives impact the social fabric of the market (e.g., sense of community, traditional practices)?

### 17. Perceived Social Changes Due to Preservation Efforts



-

Have you noticed changes in how shopkeepers or customers interact since preservation efforts began?

Yes, significant changes

- Minor changes

- No changes

If yes, what kind of changes (e.g., increased formality, less community cohesion)?

## 18. Social Tensions or Conflicts

Have WCLA's policies led to any conflicts or tensions among shopkeepers?

- Yes

- No

If yes, describe the nature of these tensions (e.g., rent disputes, shop expansion restrictions).

## 19. Impact on Customer Flow and Demographics

Since preservation began, have you noticed changes in the types of customers visiting?

- More tourists

- More locals

- Decrease in overall foot traffic

How have these changes affected your business?

## Section 5: Market Resilience and Long-term Outlook

### 20. Strategies for Business Continuity

-  
How do you adapt to the economic and social pressures on your business (e.g., forming alliances, diversification)?

## 21. Future Outlook for Business

What are your aspirations for the future of your shop in the market?

- Continue as it is
- Expand to other markets
- Pass it down to family
- Other (please specify)

## 22. Recommendations for Support

What support would you like from WCLA or local authorities to help balance preservation with your business needs?

### **Interview Guide for WCLA Management**

#### Introduction

Begin by explaining the purpose of the interview, which is to understand the preservation efforts, challenges, and community impact of WCLA's work in Old Lahore's markets.

Assure confidentiality and explain that responses will be used to gain insights into the preservation management approach in the context of Old Lahore.

Ask the interviewee to describe their role, years of experience, and specific responsibilities related to preservation within WCLA.

#### Key Questions:

##### 1. Objectives of Preservation Efforts

What are WCLA's primary objectives for preservation, particularly in Old Lahore's markets?

How are cultural, architectural, and economic aspects prioritized within these goals?

Does WCLA's approach differ for various markets (e.g., cloth market vs. oil market), and if so, how?

## 2. Implementation of Preservation Policies

Could you outline the main steps in the preservation policy process, from planning to execution, within Old Lahore?

How does WCLA conduct site evaluations to determine which areas or specific markets need preservation?

Are there specific architectural, cultural, or historical criteria that guide the selection of sites for preservation?

## 3. Challenges Encountered

What are the most common forms of resistance or challenges encountered from shopkeepers or local residents?

How do economic factors, such as potential disruptions to business, influence resistance to preservation?

Could you describe any recent example where the authority faced significant resistance, and how WCLA managed the situation?

Are there any political or regulatory obstacles that impact WCLA's ability to enforce preservation policies?

## 4. Socio Economic Considerations

How does WCLA evaluate the economic impact of preservation initiatives on small businesses, especially vendors who rely on traditional practices?

Are there dedicated programs or financial support mechanisms to assist businesses in adjusting to preservation related changes (e.g., subsidies, loans, grants)?

How does WCLA address the risk of "gentrification" or commercial displacement due to increased foot traffic or rising rents in preserved areas?

## 5. Community Engagement and Communication

How does WCLA inform market vendors and the broader community about upcoming preservation projects? Are there formal channels, workshops, or public meetings?

What strategies does WCLA use to encourage community input and participation in preservation planning?

Has WCLA established any partnerships with local community groups, business associations, or market unions to facilitate communication?

How does the authority address community feedback or concerns when they conflict with preservation objectives?

## 6. Integration of Traditional Practices in Preservation

Does WCLA take steps to preserve not only physical structures but also the traditional practices and cultural elements unique to these markets?

Are there specific markets where traditional practices (e.g., artisanal production, indigenous selling methods) are incorporated into the preservation plan?

How does WCLA ensure that preserved spaces remain accessible and relevant to the local community rather than shifting toward a more commercialized, tourism focused model?

## 7. Monitoring and Evaluation

Does WCLA have a system for monitoring the effectiveness and impact of preservation projects after they are implemented?

How does WCLA assess whether preservation efforts have successfully balanced conservation with the economic and social needs of market communities?

Are there periodic reviews or follow-up assessments to adjust preservation policies based on observed outcomes?

## 8. Future Directions and Adaptability

What are WCLA's long-term plans for preserving Old Lahore, and how do these plans account for anticipated changes (e.g., urbanization, evolving community needs)?

How does WCLA approach sustainability within its preservation framework to ensure that efforts can adapt to changing conditions and community feedback?

Does WCLA have any strategies in place to prepare for potential impacts of modernization and urban development pressures on Old Lahore's sites?

## 9. Insights and Recommendations

Based on your experiences, what strategies or policies do you believe are most effective in ensuring that preservation initiatives benefit both cultural and local businesses?

Are there particular preservation models or methods from other cities or countries that WCLA would consider implementing in Old Lahore?

Do you have any recommendations for improving the collaboration between WCLA and local businesses to support a more inclusive preservation process?

## Conclusion

Thank the interviewee for their time and contributions to the study.

Ask if they have any concluding thoughts or suggestions on balancing preservation with the livelihood needs of Old Lahore's traditional markets.

Offer an opportunity for the interviewee to share any additional insights or observations that may be valuable to understanding the WCLA's role in preserving Old Lahore's.

## **Interview Guide for Shop Owners**

### **1. Role and Presence of Authorities:**

- How would you describe the role of authorities in your market?

- Do you feel their actions benefit or hinder your work?

## **2. Market Conditions:**

- What are the biggest challenges your market faces in terms of infrastructure and safety?
- How are these issues affecting your business and the market as a whole?

## **3. Community or Union Role:**

- Are there any organizations or unions supporting market traders?
- How effective have they been in addressing market concerns?

## **4. Impact of Modernization:**

- Have you noticed changes in the market due to modernization?
- What do you think should be preserved in the market, and what needs improvement?

## **5. Political and Social Factors:**

- How do local politics influence the development or preservation of your market?
- What collective actions, if any, could improve the market's condition?

## **6. Potential Solutions:**

- What steps do you think could address the challenges faced by the market?
- How could collaboration between traders, unions, and authorities improve the situation?