

MPRA

Munich Personal RePEc Archive

Changing patterns of Pakistani emigrants and institutional framework

Mohammad, Irfan

Pakistan Institute of Development Economics Islamabad Pakistan

1999

Online at <https://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/38620/>

MPRA Paper No. 38620, posted 07 May 2012 12:52 UTC

***CHANGING PATTERNS OF PAKISTANI EMIGRANTS
AND INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK***

Mohammad Irfan

**Pakistan Institute of Development Economics
Islamabad
December 1999**

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
SECTION - I: VOLUME AND DIRECTION OF EMIGRANTS	2
Middle East Contract Migration	3
Recent Emigration Trend	4
Illegal Emigration/Immigration	6
Consequences of Emigration	9
SECTION - II: INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK	12
Problems of Overseas Pakistanis	15
Trade Unions	18
SECTION - III: MACRO ECONOMIC CONTEXT AND EMIGRATION PRESSURES	21
Emigration Pressures	25
SECTION - IV: CONCLUDING REMARKS	27
REFERENCES	30

List of Tables

Table 1:	Region-wise Number of Overseas Pakistanis	4
Table 2:	Distribution of Overseas Pakistanis: 1995-98	5
Table 3:	Stocks of Pakistanis in the Middle East, 1985-88	7
Table 4:	Illegal Migrants: 1995-96	8
Table 5:	Percentage Distributions of Return Migrants by Financial Cost Incurred in Securing Employment in the Middle East, by Country of Employment	14
Table 6:	Activities of Community Welfare Attaches	18
Table 7:	Employment and Labour Productivity: 1987-94	22
Table 8:	Real Wages Per Day for Different Categories of Workers (1980-81 Prices)	23
Table 9:	Unemployment and Underemployment Rates, 1968-69 to 1996-97	23
Table 10:	Inactivity Rates of Graduates by Discipline: 1993/95	24

List of Appendix Tables

Appendix Table 1:	Pakistanis in the United Kingdom 1961-81	31
Appendix Table 2:	Statement Showing Pakistanis Who Left Abroad for Higher Studies/Jobs During 1961-66	32
Appendix Table 3:	Year/Country Wise Emigration from Pakistan: 1971-1999	32
Appendix Table 4:	Share of Pakistani Workers in the Annual Placement of South Asian Workers in the Middle East	33
Appendix Table 5:	Occupational Composition of Pakistani Workers in the Middle East, 1977-96	34
Appendix Table 6:	Information Sought from Embassies	35
Appendix Table 7:	Registered Trade Unions with Membership (All Pakistan)	35
Appendix Table 8:	Projected Unemployment Rate by Educational Level (Projection)	36

CHANGING PATTERNS OF PAKISTANI EMIGRANTS AND INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

INTRODUCTION

This paper attempts at documenting and analysing the volume and spatial pattern of Pakistani emigration during 1990's. Also an effort is made to describe the institutional structure, workers grievances and redressal mechanism. The findings of the research exercise are presented into four sections.

Using the information pertaining to annual placement of workers mostly in the middle East and estimates provided by Pakistani Missions abroad the changes in the spatial spread of emigrants is detailed in the first section. Also sketchy information on illegal migration is described. Major findings of the past studies on consequences of emigration are briefly added too.

Institutional framework related to emigration is the subject matter of the second section. Recruitment industry and cost of migration is briefly described. Nature of the trade unions and the possible role in alleviating the problems of the emigrants finds its place in this section too. Third section briefly describes the existing macro-economic context, the GDP growth, employment and unemployment. On the basis of these the potential for emigration is assessed. Concluding remarks containing suggestion regarding instituting a monitoring mechanism, improvement of institutional structures and involvement of trade unions are presented in the final section.

SECTION - I

VOLUME AND DIRECTION OF EMIGRANTS

A BRIEF REVIEW

The history of emigration from the areas constituting Pakistan is spread over more or less 150 years. Under the British Empire, the plantation interest created the situation wherein the cheap labour was to be provided under the indentured system. This system, according to some critics (), was more or less a trade in the slave labour. Any way, according to Kingsley Davis () during the 100 years of 1834-1937, 6.2 million (net outflow) people emigrated from the British India mostly to South and East Africa and other parts of the colonial empire.

Since independence, emigration from Pakistan represents diverse patterns, in terms of skill content and direction. Because of colonial links with U.K. and shortage of labour felt in that economy, the unskilled labour from Pakistan emigrated to U.K. during 1950s and mid-1960s. This exodus of workers, presumably a contract emigration to begin with wherein the emigrants may have returned to their homes in Pakistan; changed with the imposition of Common Wealth Immigration Act 1962. This put controls on immigration but permitted the entry of dependents, which changed the composition of Pakistanis in U.K. wherein share of female and children rose overtime. The stock of Pakistanis in U.K. during the period of 1961-1981 registered a substantial increase from 32000 to 295000 (see Appendix Table 1). It may be noted that the latter number is inclusive of a sizeable fraction (40% of total) of those Pakistanis who were born in U.K., thereby making it difficult to infer the actual outflow from Pakistan.

During 1960s, the emigration of skilled and educated people from Pakistan also took place to some Western countries and Middle East. This type of emigration is generally termed as brain-drain. Given the data limitations, the total number involved has been more or less a matter of speculation. Generally, the emigrants were composed of the professionals like physicians, medical specialists, engineers and other educated workers (see Appendix Table 2). According to one estimate, around 14000 highly qualified Pakistanis went abroad during 1961-66. Around one-fourths of these were medical doctors. Libya, Saudi Arabia and U.K. were the major destinations of these professional emigrants.

It may also be noted that the outflow of Pakistani educated manpower did not discontinue though it may have subsided during 1970's. For instance, studies do suggest that during 1967-73, around 1400 Pakistani professionals emigrated only to Canada. During the 1980s, liberalization in the emigration policies of the West, the brain-drain appears to have been picked up again. The number of Pakistani emigrants admitted to United States increased

from 14000 during 1982-84 to 37000 during 1985-89. As detailed in the next subsection on Recent Emigration Trends, a comparison of stock of Pakistanis abroad suggests that the direction of Pakistani exodus is undergoing a major change wherein large numbers are flocking to the West rather than to the Middle East as is generally perceived. Middle East migration is briefly discussed below.

MIDDLE EAST CONTRACT MIGRATION

Labour migration from Pakistan to the Middle East on a large scale started in the 1970s. During 1972-98, the annual placement of Pakistani workers in the Middle East fluctuated substantially peaking in 1977 at 140,000 and again in 1981 at 151,500. In the subsequent five years it declined dramatically. Then subsequently during the period 1987-92, placements increased steadily, after the Gulf War reaching a record level of 195,400 in 1992. During the last five years annual placements declined from 157,700 in 1993 to 104,000 in 1998. (See Appendix Table 3). Annual flow data do suggest a stagnation or decline for recent five years. Increase in the volume of emigration during 1992-94 partly reflects substitution of Yemenis and Palestinians by Pakistanis in Saudi Arabia after Gulf War in 1991. Also minimum wage standard hitherto applied were relaxed by Pakistani authorities.

More importantly, Pakistan's share in the annual placement of South Asian workers in the Middle East declined dramatically from 73 per cent in 1977 to only 24 per cent in 1986. After 1986 its share increased modestly, reaching about 30 percent in 1989, but it fell again to 26 percent in 1991 and to only 18 per cent in 1993. (See Appendix Table 4).

Several factors have been responsible for the decline in share of Pakistan. Firstly, Arab governments are sensitive to a predominance of workers from a particular country. They have therefore chosen to diversify their sources of labour supply. As a result, Pakistanis faced increased competition from other labour exporting countries, particularly Filipinos and Bangladeshis who have been contracted in increasing numbers since 1985 at relatively low wages. Secondly, since the mid-1980s, due to decline in oil price economic activity has slowed in the major labour-receiving countries. Pakistani workers in the Middle East have been mostly employed in construction sector with the completion of development projects the demand for labour decreased. Thirdly, there has been a shift in labour demand from production and construction workers to professional and service workers. However, the occupational composition of Pakistani migrants to Middle East over the last two decades has changed only slightly, and majority of migrant workers is still engaged in the construction sector (see Appendix Table 5). This shift in demand also entailed an increasing feminisation of the work force, particularly recruitment of housemaids. Pakistan banned the female to work as domestic servants under the age of 45. Although in 1989 the minimum age was reduced to 35 years, emigration of female workers is still numerically

insignificant because of the cultural factors. The oil price decline during the mid 1990's and stagnation in the Middle East further slashed the demand for expatriate workers. In fact the recent emergence of unemployment in Middle Eastern countries led the governments to restrict issuance of visas to unskilled and certain semi-skilled workers. Not only have the annual placements in Middle East tended to decline or stagnate but there has been a rise in the number of return migration (See Appendix Table 7) resulting in the curtailment in net out-migrants. This is further detailed below which is based on data on stock of Pakistanis rather than the annual placements.

RECENT EMIGRATION TRENDS

Based on the data provided by Pakistani Missions abroad to the Ministry of Labour, migration trends can be inferred. The procedures used to estimate Pakistanis are not detailed by Pakistani Missions. The total number of Pakistanis is presumably guesstimated by Missions and provided to Ministry though the latter requests for further details too (See Appendix Table 6). Similarly the number of Pakistani worker is estimated by Missions. However in case the workers are not reported the crude labour force participation of the host country is used by Ministry of Labour & Manpower to estimate the same. Information pertaining to two years (1995 & 1998) is also tabulated by broad regions of the world, to demonstrate that trend obtained on the basis of stock of Pakistani could diverge from those of estimated workers.

The estimated stock of Pakistanis abroad in Table 1 is indicative of a persistent decline during 1983 - 1988 from 1.9 million to 1.5. Nearly all of this decline occurred in Middle East and Africa. This trend is also corroborated by the annual placement data pertaining to Middle East, as discussed already.

Table 1
Region-wise Number of Overseas Pakistanis

Year	Total	Africa	America	Asia, Far East Australia	Europe	Middle East
1983	1941159	102192	154027	32158	430565	1222217
1984	1843506	64472	150076	49917	435090	1143951
1985	1697012	34791	170093	49191	466733	976204
1987	1641050	24833	195120	44200	479044	697855
1988	1481441	30606	262166	54942	356178	787540
1990	1827943	22382	448099	36397	434110	886955
1992	2691304	22180	510052	52831	942042	1164199
1995	3010672	28813	450052	63825	955424	1512558
1997	3053447	16457	450105	69380	998856	1518649
1998	3182473	18213	605152	72690	934068	1552350

Source: Pakistani Missions.

Note: Source and method of collection remains unknown.

During the 1990's exodus of Pakistani's appeared to have picked up again wherein the estimated stock in 1998 is more than twice of 1988 and 64% larger than the 1983 stock. However a change in the direction of outflow is discernable. While Middle East still accounts for nearly half of the Pakistani emigrants its share in fact was 63% in 1983. On the other hand the share of America (which includes Canada also) went up from 8% to 20% in the total Pakistanis abroad during 1983-98. An estimated net outflow on the basis of the data on stocks is reflective of a gradual decline in the share of Middle East from 45% for 1988-98 to 10% or so in 1995-98. A quantum jump in the estimated stock in Europe during 1990-92 needs further investigation. Country specific information indicates that most of this increase has been registered in U.K. Further probing is required to determine the extent to which this rise in the estimated stock entailed mobility of worker, because number of Pakistanis in U.K. can also increase through the population growth of those already settled, thanks to the entitlement of dual nationality. America has been the receiving region accounting for 90% of net outflow during 1995-98. It may be noted that stock reported for Europe declined during this sub-period. A closer focus on the 1995-98 data including estimated number of workers is made below. The data are provided in Table 2.

Table 2
Distribution of Overseas Pakistanis: 1995-98

Region	Number of Workers as on			
	31.12.1995		31.12.1998	
	Workers	Total	Workers	Total
Africa	16318	28813 (1)	9641	18213 (.5)
America	225026	450052 (15)	302571	605152 (19)
Asia, Far East & Australia	36540	63825 (2)	42021	72690 (2)
Europe	685904	955424 (32)	699820	934068 (29)
Middle East	1220524	1512558 (50)	934587	1552350 (49)
Grand Total	2184312	3010672 (100)	1988640	3182473 (100)

Source: 1) Economic Survey of Pakistan 1995-96.

2) Ministry of Labour and Manpower. Estimates by Pakistani Missions abroad for 1998.

3) Parenthesis denote percentage distribution.

The Table indicates a rise in the total number of Pakistanis abroad by 5.7% during 1995-98 but interestingly there is a decline in the number of workers by 9% during the same period. A perusal of the table reveals that decline in the number of workers have occurred in Europe, Middle East and Africa. Excepting Middle East the total number of Pakistanis also declined in those regions. The anomaly

between Middle East estimates of worker and total number during 1995-98 could be partly due to changes in composition of emigrants wherein a higher ratio of dependents emigrated. Part of the reasons may have been the crude procedure used to estimate workers.

A closer scrutiny of the data by region is suggestive of a change in the direction of the emigrant flow. While Middle East still accounts for nearly half of the Pakistani emigrants its importance in the recent outflow has substantially been curtailed and stocks registered only 2.6% rise. In contrast America and Canada registered a 34% growth during 1995/98. This region now accounts for 20% of total Pakistani emigrants. Both Africa and Europe have experienced decline but Asia, Far East and Australia experienced rise in its stock from 63000 to 72000 with 2% of total Pakistan migrants residing in this region.

The country specific data indicate that in East Asia, the stock of Pakistanis declined in Japan but rose in Thailand & South Korea during this period. An interesting pattern appears to have emerged in Europe wherein there is a shift away from U.K. to other non-English speaking countries with almost 50% rise of the Pakistanis in Netherlands, and substantial increments made by Sweden, Denmark and Germany in this respect. In case of Africa there has been a widespread decline in the stock of Pakistanis particularly pronounced in South Africa, Libya and Mozambique. In case of Middle East the stock of emigrants declined in Saudi Arabia, Oman and Qatar while it rose in Kuwait and U.A.E.

To the extent these data approximate reality then juxtaposition of these stocks with the annual placement data for Middle East suggests that Pakistan must have been experiencing massive return migration from Middle East during the late 1990's. In addition exodus of Pakistanis to America and Canada is indicative of a quantum jump in the brain drain and entrepreneurial exodus from the country.

Given that most of the emigrants to West bypass the official registration and protection system essentially envisaged to cater to the needs of Middle Eastern emigrants there is a desperate need to re-examine its role. In addition not only is there the need to conduct surveys on return migrants to understand the dynamics of emigration but secondary data available in U.S.A., Canada and other countries in Europe must be subjected to exhaustive investigation to document the volume and characteristics of Pakistani emigrants in these countries. Existing information base is inadequate to facilitate meaningful analysis.

ILLEGAL EMIGRATION/IMMIGRATION

Quantification of illegal migration is a difficult rather almost impossible task. Not only is it difficult to erect a perfect monitoring system but the transient nature of the very status pertaining to legality of a migrant worker further makes it difficult

to estimate. Counting migrant workers itself poses a formidable challenge. This is manifest from the wide divergence of the stock estimates of Pakistani's in Middle East by Seccombe 0.77 Million based on host country information and the one by Pakistan's embassies (1.024 million) for the same year of 1985.

Still efforts have been made to document the extent of illegal migration essentially using the information collected through field surveys of return migrants. Azam for instance on the basis of survey of 800 returnees found that only 48% of the workers had a work contract at the time of departure. In other words 52% had left Pakistan without work visa hence could be characterised as illegal migrant. Similarly PIPO's survey of 1983 was indicative of 57% of those who departed were illegal. Stahl (13) based on these surveys tried to re-estimate the stocks of Pakistani's abroad for the period 1985-88 as detailed below in Table 3.

Table 3

Stocks of Pakistanis in the Middle East, 1985-88

Year	Stock Based on Official Emigration Data	Stock Adjusted for Pre-1973 Emigration	Stock Adjusted for Pre-1973 Emigration and Clandestine Emigration ^a
1985	563,458	584,458	1,194,870
1986	543,765	563,715	1,152,794
1987	536,062	555,015	1,135,749
1988	541,964	559,947	1,147,075

Source: Asian and PACIFIC Population Forum, Vol.4, No.2, Summer, 1990. East-West Population Institute.

^a) To adjust for clandestine migration, author divided the official emigration data by 0.48 and added to this figure the pre-1973 stock, e.g., for 1985, $584,458 - 563,458 = 21,000$ (the pre-1973 stock). $(563,458/0.48) + 21,000 = 1,194,870$.

The above re-estimated stocks being almost twice that of the official registration data tend to counsel application of care in drawing strong conclusion on the basis of the latter. Also the wide divergence between the two is indicative of massive prevalence of illegal migration. It may be noted that Stahl viewed that around half of those who did not have valid documents while departing Pakistan may have acquired the work contract in the host countries. However this is simply an assumption, thereby indicating that the estimated illegal migrants in host countries are lower than the one would have on the basis of surveys in the sending country.

Surveys of return migrants soliciting the reason of return can also provide alternative estimates of illegal migration. Two such surveys conducted in 1980s are suggestive of a rise in the fraction of return migrants who were deported from

the Middle Eastern countries. In the PIDE survey of 1980 it was 18% of the return migrants which rose to 27% in 1986 ILO survey. The above cited evidences relating to 1980s is indicative of one fourths to half of the Pakistani's in Middle East being illegal.

Unfortunately little is known about the volume of illegal migration during 1990's, simply because of the absence of surveys which generated this information. The information sought by Ministry of Labour from Pakistani embassies often happens to be incomplete and also suffer from under coverage. Recent information available with Ministry relates to 1995-96. This is reproduced below in Table 4.

Table 4
Illegal Migrants - 1995-96

Name of Country	Number of Illegal Overseas Pakistanis
1. South Africa	2000 - 3000
2. Belgium	1000 - 1500
3. South Korea	3000
4. Greece	10,000 approximately
5. Libya	8000
6. Bahrain	Large number
7. France	20,000 approximately
8. Spain	2500
9. Italy	5000
10. Lebanon	400 - 500
11. Oman	Mainly sponsor involved
12. Romania	300
13. Bulgaria	100
14. Moldova	50
15. Germany	Large number (Qadianis)
16. Japan	10,000 - 20,000
17. Turkey	250
18. Iran	800 - 1000
19. Jordan	1000 - 1500

Source: Ministry of Labour and Manpower.

There is little information available on the extent of illegal migration for the entire Middle East which still accounts for half of Pakistani emigrants. Data reported for other countries are interesting as well as disturbing. For instance very large number suggests that Greece may be just a transit camp for onward mobility to Europe. Similarly a large number of illegal Pakistanis are reported in Germany who presumably got permission to stay in that country on the grounds of religious persecution, belonging to Qadiani sect.

The official data on illegal migrants is no doubt limited and sketchy. However in certain cases it suggests that volume of illegal migrants surpasses the official estimates of stock of Pakistani's in that country. A comparison of this table with country specific data for instance yields that in case of Japan, and Korea the officially reported illegal migrants are more than twice of the officially estimated stocks of Pakistanis. Under the changing emigration trends and direction during 1990's wherein America & Canada have emerged as major destinations, concept of illegal migration needs to be sharpened. Most of Pakistani emigrate to these countries on student/visit visas but get assimilated in the host country labour market. No information pertaining to their legal status in host country is available, while departing Pakistan they were all legal.

IMMIGRATION

Pakistan is also a major destination of undocumented migrants from other areas of South Asia, especially Bangladesh, Burma, India and Sri Lanka. The anecdotal estimates of the number of Bangladeshis range between one and one and half million; for Burmese, the figure is 200,000. The Burmese are likely to be located mainly in the Karachi area. It is also suggested that a substantial proportion of Bangladeshi are located in Karachi, where they work in low productivity service industries, such as restaurants, grocery stores, as domestic servants [Stahl and Appleyard (1991)]. Some of these illegal immigrants after a brief stay in Pakistan depart for the Middle East.

Illegal migration to Pakistan from surrounding countries is alleged to be quite substantial at present. A part of this inflow stays in Pakistan while the remainder leaves for other countries mainly to Middle East. Karachi, at present, is a transit camp for illegal migrants from diverse directions ranging from Sri Lanka to Central Asian Republics. The ease with which the identity cards and passports of Pakistan are acquired by these illegal migrants simply bespeaks of the standard of honesty prevailing at present in the dispensation. There is a need to examine the possibility of improving the practices of alien registration and issuance of passport to check these practices. Monitoring of population mobility whether it is influx or exodus has deteriorated over the years. There is a need to improve the system through the introduction of computer technology and frequent airport and household surveys to keep track of both legal as well as illegal migration.

CONSEQUENCES OF EMIGRATION

Manpower exodus to Middle East had a wide-ranging effect which still awaits a sound analysis. The effects of the remittances, the coterminous flow, on the recipient households have generally been regarded as positive, a rise in income and consumption levels, release of capital constraints for investment activity

including educational investment. A drastic drop in the incidence of poverty of the recipient households has been noticed too. Not much is known about the impact of this manpower exodus and inflow of remittances on the non-migrant households. Obviously, the demonstration effect of rising consumption level of recipient households may have influenced the behaviour of non-migrant households too.

The impact on the total economy needs a rigorous exercise reckoning with both the direct and indirect effects of labour exodus and the remittances. The net balance for engagement in such a transaction for the country at present is not very clear. This manifests itself from relative insensitivity of some of the macro indicators like investment and saving as fraction of GDP, juxtaposed with the flow of remittances over the years. It may also be noted that the inflow of foreign remittances appears to have elevated the consumption standards of the country which may not be consistent with the resource base. For instance, in contrast to real per capita income growth of 63 percent between 1975-76 to 1996-97, the consumption of electricity has gone up by a factor of 16 in the household sector and the number of cars multiplied itself by seven times during this period. In essence, if one were to look at Pakistan which received 37 billion US dollars through official channels as remittance over the past two decades or so, little can be presented as an evidence of use of this money except construction of houses and plazas. On the other hand, the studies do find a positive impact of the inflow of remittances on the incidence of poverty in Pakistan. In fact, the period during which the country received substantial amount of remittances, the level of poverty in the country had gone down. Similarly, one should not under-rate the importance of workers remittances in providing an easy access to the foreign exchange and also substituting the foreign funds at least to keep the investment rate intact. There is a need to be emphatic about one lesson though unpalatable that labour exports are neither a panacea nor a substitute for sound development policies. If the government does not create an economic environment that is conducive to investment and productivity at home, one cannot conclude that the inflow of remittances is inherently associated with consumption liberalisation and less productive activities. At the same time, in the absence of sound economic policies, all the official schemes to channelise the remittances into productive uses will meet with limited success.

Unemployment rate yielded by Labour Force Surveys remained more or less insensitive to exodus of labour to Middle East. Studies did however, suggest that exodus of labour influenced choice of techniques and factor mix both as a direct consequences of labour outflow and indirectly through the expenditure pattern out of remittances. During the periods of massive labour outflow labour market tightened and real wages rose across the board. In addition negative influence on labour productivity has been noted too, because generally more productive workers were creamed off through emigration.

The ramifications of massive exodus of Pakistani workers needs to be understood in the overall context of the economy. This is not to suggest that such an

emigration should be curtailed but policies to minimise the negative impact of this exodus on the economy and society are needed. Short-term contract migration to Middle East and recently to East Asia represents a unique type of transaction wherein exported commodity has to be re-imported in the shape of return-migration. Thus reintegration of return migrants emerges as a major challenge. The labour market integration of a labour abundant country with a capital-rich and labour-short economy in addition also poses a challenge to policy makers to shield the factor prices, choices of product and technology in the domestic market from transient influences of short-term emigration and inflow of remittances.

To the extent Pakistan is caught up with a phenomena of brain-drain at larger scale than in the sixties, this will entail sacrifices from the economy and the society. The country at present experiences shortages of computer programmers because majority of newly trained leaves for the West. There is a need to consider the imposition of user costs to recover the entire amount invested in the education of qualified persons departing Pakistan. It makes more sense because most of the educated and highly qualified people who leave the country tend to delink from Pakistan with little remittances, if any, and currently a high level of subsidy is provided to tertiary education.

SECTION - II

INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

Formulation and coordination of the policies relating to labour administration and employment promotion rests with Ministry of Labour Manpower and Overseas Pakistanis. Despite being on the concurrent list most of the policies relating to labour administration are enacted at Federal level while the implementation rests with the provincial governments. The existing structure is reflective of the functional separation between labour relations and employment promotion and training. Overseas employment falls under the domain of the latter. Prior to 1993 Manpower and Overseas Pakistanis was enjoying a status of a separate Division within the Ministry. With the implementation of the recommendations of the Economy Commission 1993, two divisions were merged into one with two wings i.e. Labour and the Manpower and Overseas Pakistanis Wing to represent the defunct divisions.

Manpower and Overseas Pakistanis Wing charged with the functions of coordinating the policies and programmes related to manpower and employment is comprised of three major units with number of attached organisation. The three major units are Administrative Unit, Technical/Research Unit and Overseas Pakistanis Unit.

Administration, Co-ordination and Emigration Unit looks after the administrative matters as detailed under Emigration Ordinance of 1979. The unit is headed by Joint secretary and provides administrative control and policy formulation regarding Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment Corporation (OEC). Also issues licenses to Overseas Employment Promoters (OEP).

Technical and Research Unit is entrusted with the task of formulating national policies regarding manpower development and employment promotion. In addition to collection and analysis of relevant data the Unit sponsors research activities. It used to publish a - annual Pakistan manpower Review which currently appears to have been discontinued. However the unit regularly disseminates information through "A Handbooks on Manpower and Employment in Pakistan" - an annual publication.

Major functions of the Overseas Pakistanis Unit are to provide a redressal mechanism for the complaints and grievances of emigrants mostly through CWA's, examination and analysis of the issues related to manpower export. In addition subject to availability of the funds this unit sponsors the field and airport surveys to collect relevant information regarding emigration. Also through Community Welfare Attaches (CWA) and Pakistani Missions abroad, facilitates monitoring the issues related to Pakistani emigration, volume, direction and problems.

There is a need to re-examine the relevance, adequacy and effectiveness of the institutional apparatus to meet the challenges under changing macro-economic management practices and globalisation. Should subjects like employment promotion and training be exclusive functions of a unit in Ministry of Labour when the factors impinging upon these lie beyond the scope of state intervention leaving aside a unit in a sub-division. [See Irfan (8)]. Regarding overseas employment one fails to understand the existing arrangements wherein the OEC, BIOE, and Overseas Pakistani Unit, function as separate entities. There is a need to examine the proposals made by ILO to set up a unified overseas employment administration (ILO Sectoral Review Mission, 1986).

Recruitment Industry

In contradistinction to the previous practices wherein labour importing countries established recruiting offices in labour sending countries emigration of unskilled/semi-skilled workers to Middle East and East Asia has been arranged by private recruiting agents. Workers are also hired through a government agency such as Overseas Employment corporation (OEC) and employers also send visas directly to workers. These latter arrangements account for a limited number of emigrants.

Recruitment through private agents emerged as a major business activity during the boom in Middle East construction. The process of issuance of license to OEP has been liberalised to boost manpower exports. While the security fee (Rs. one lac) and license fee of Rs. 5000 per year is still operative the duration of license is extended from one year (the previous practice) to two years. Uptill now 1947 licenses have been issued but currently only 951 OEP are operating. This decline reflects slackening demand in Middle East.

An overwhelming majority of emigrants in Middle East and East Asia got recruited through private sectors OEP. In fact the share of OECF, a governmental recruiting agency in the total placement made so far has been almost insignificant accounting for 7% to 8% of the total. The recruiting agents are legally authorised to charge a fee from the emigrants for his services which range from obtaining job offers in labour importing country, preparation of necessary documents and other formalities.

Cost of Migration

Private recruitment at both ends in labour exporting and importing countries is alleged to be suffering from various types of malpractices, corruption and dishonesty. Invariably the cost of getting a job in Middle East has been reported to be sufficiently higher than the officially prescribed which is currently around Rs. 4500.00. In addition many aspirants paid money but did not get jobs in Middle East. Being buyers market the emigrant has to bear the costs according to

the dictates of the recruiting agents. An ILO Survey conducted in 1986 asked from the return migrants "How much did you spend in arranging for your job in Middle East?" The responses are provided in Table 5.

Cost of migration on the average was much higher than the officially stipulated charges of the recruiting agent. Costs vary by country of destinations presumably level of wages in host country have a positive association with costs. As reflected by the table average cost of obtaining employment in Kuwait was higher than for other countries. Arif (4) using multivariate regression framework tried to identify the factors bearing upon cost of migration.

Table 5
Percentage Distributions of Return Migrants by Financial Cost
Incurred in Securing Employment in the Middle East, by Country
of Employment

Country of Employment	Average Cost	Cost Range					Total	(N)
		Nil	<5000 (Rs)	5000-10000 (Rs)	10000-15000 (Rs)	>15000 (Rs)		
Kuwait	12,100	12.5	27.1	16.7	14.6	29.1	100	(48)
Saudi Arabia	10,800	5.6	20.8	29.5	20.8	23.3	100	(696)
Libya	10,000	6.1	32.7	38.8	14.3	8.1	100	(82)
Iraq	9,300	11.1	21.0	19.8	40.7	7.4	100	(81)
Qatar	9,200	10.7	39.3	14.3	10.7	25.0	100	(28)
UAE	8,100	11.6	33.1	26.0	14.9	14.4	100	(181)
Bahrain	7,900	2.4	33.3	33.3	26.2	4.8	100	(42)
Oman	7,200	6.1	32.7	38.8	14.3	8.1	100	(49)
Others	6,500	4.5	52.5	13.7	22.8	4.5	100	(44)
Total sample	9,870	7.1	25.2	27.3	21.7	18.7	100	(1251)

Source: Computed from the 1986 ILO survey data
Rs = Pakistani rupees

According to his analysis return migrants located in urban areas were likely to have paid less to find employment in the Middle East than those who resided in rural areas. Similarly, professional and clerical workers were likely to have borne lower costs of migration than workers in other occupations. With respect to country of destination, migration to Kuwait, Libya, Saudi Arabia and Qatar, where wages offered were higher than wages in other countries of the region, turned out to be positively related to the cost of migration. It seems that recruiting agents set higher prices for providing jobs in countries where earning opportunities are greater. The year of migration also turned out to be statistically significant and positive, showing that costs of migration have increased over time.

PROBLEMS OF OVERSEAS PAKISTANIS

It is estimated that over 3 million Pakistanis are in various countries of the World. The problems faced by Pakistanis abroad differ from region to region and country depending on socio-economic and political system of the host country. Major problems faced by Pakistanis in various regions and countries as revealed by official sources are summarised below:

PROBLEMS OF PAKISTANIS IN GULF STATES

(a) Non-implementation of Foreign Service Agreement (FSA)

Foreign Service Agreements signed by the recruited employees and the Overseas Employment Promoters on behalf of the employers, indicating the terms and conditions of employment and the rights and obligations of both the parties, are sometimes not honoured by the employers. The agreements are normally substituted on arrival of workers containing terms/conditions less favourable to the migrant workers.

(b) Illegal Termination

In some cases the employees are arbitrarily dismissed without resorting to the process provided in the labour laws. Since the workers lack resources, finance and legal services, in most of the cases they hesitate to contest the decisions of the employers in the labour courts.

(c) Delay in Despatch of Dead Bodies

In G.C.C. states. It is the responsibility of the sponsor to get the dead body cleared and arrange for its despatch. The sponsors generally do not accord priority to this and the clearance for the despatch takes longer time. At times the sponsors do not pay for the charges for despatch of dead bodies.

(d) Delay in Payment of Blood Money Death Compensation to the Legal Heirs of Deceased

Finalisation of cases of payment of death compensation to legal heirs of deceased Pakistanis who die either in traffic accidents or due to occupational hazards, invariably takes long time. The inordinate delay adds to the problems of bereaved families. The procedure involved, particularly by the Saudi and Kuwaiti authorities to finalise such cases is cumbersome and lengthy.

PROBLEMS IN LIBYA

Pakistani expatriate community working in Libya are facing problems of endorsement of residence visas, payment of salaries and other dues on final exit, remittance of their earning through banks and air travel etc. Due to UN Security council sponsored sanctions the situation has aggravated.

PROBLEMS IN SOUTH KOREA

More than 50% Pakistani trainees brought in south Korea during 1994-95, have run away from the original employers to get jobs with better wages. They complain about improper food and lack of medical facilities.

PROBLEMS IN EUROPE AND UNITED KINGDOM (UK)

- (a) Visa difficulty for divided family members from Pakistan to join their family members in U.K.
- (b) In UK some times unprovoked racial attacks take place. Pakistani community feels that on such occasions the attitude of local police is not sympathetic with them. There are many militant organisations in UK i.e. National Front, Column 88, Skin Heads, etc., which some times intensify their activities by attacking the coloured people. But there are also organisations like Commission for Racial Equality, Race Relation Commission etc. which attempt to harmonise race relation among the different communities.
- (c) Maltreatment at British Ports of Entry by Immigration authorities with the relatives of Pakistanis residing in UK.
- (d) Indifferent and some times biased attitude of British Security Authorities and Police.
- (e) Cultural and Social Disputes (relating to marriages, divorce, custody of children, family tax and relief).
- (f) Problems arising from disputes among various Pakistani groups having different political or religious affiliation.
- (g) Certificates issued in Pakistan duly attested by Ministry of Foreign Affairs but not honoured by British officials.
- (h) Non-recognition of second marriage contracted in Pakistan.

PROBLEMS OF PAKISTANIS IN USA

Pakistanis in USA are confronted with the problems relating to culture, social mores, religion and racism, such as lack of meeting place for "NAMAZ". Jewish hostility and difficulty in obtaining "HILAL" meet. The other problems of grave concern for Pakistanis in USA is the future life style of their children in an alien culture. Some Pakistanis also face discriminatory treatment on the basis of race while looking for the jobs.

Pakistanis engaged in the business activities in USA belong to the extended family network. One of the issue which constantly occupies the Pakistanis who become citizens of the United States is that of dual citizenship. Since the US Government does not permit its citizens to hold another passport. As such, these expatriates are not treated as Pakistanis in terms of travel and other facilities.

REDRESSAL MECHANISM

In order to safeguard the interest of the workers abroad. Ministry of Labour, Manpower and Overseas Pakistanis has created 14 posts of Community Welfare Attaches in 9 countries having majority of Pakistani workers and emerging labour markets. These countries include UK, Saudi Arabia, Oman, Qatar, Kuwait, Bahrain, UAE, Malaysia, South Korea. The Community Welfare Attaches work under the financial and administrative control of the head of missions in the respective countries.

CWA (Community Welfare Attache) is supposed to perform important function of promotion of manpower export and redressal of grievances of workers in the host country. Undertaking of promotional activities by CWA entail analysis of the economic growth and labour market trends of the host country, projections of future labour demand patterns and discussion with overseas employers. In addition attestation of the relevant documents is also made by CWA. In order to redress the worker's grievances CWA attends to the complaints. As a feedback mechanism CWA submits biannual and monthly reports.

Nature of complaints generally pertain to non-payment of original promised wages and failure to comply with the original contract by the employers. Table 6 provides information based on the monthly reports for the three years of 1995-97. The entire information pertains to Middle East. There is a steep decline in the number of demand letter attested which reflects curtailment in the expatriate labour demand. While there is some decline in the number of complaints received but the number of settlement in progress has risen during these years. In case of compensation cases not yet settled the number appears to be large. Issuance of outpasses for deportation of illegal migration appears to have more than doubled during this period of three years.

Table 6

Activities of Community Welfare Attaches

Name of Activity	1995	1996	1997
1. Demand letters attested	7079	3027	1309
2. Persons involved	12282	21716	19764
3. Individual agreements/visas attested	1436	4591	1458
4. Field visit for promotion of manpower export	310	287	149
5. Complaints received	1028	658	800
6. Disputes settled	1857	1270	516
7. Settlement in progress	232	364	31186
8. Jails/hospitals/labour camps visited	464	508	535
9. Dead bodies repatriated	782	1279	845
10. Compensation cases received	549	1028	1951
11. Compensation cases settled	305	781	1124
12. Compensation cases not yet settled	2576	3067	320
13. Outpasses issued for deportation of illegals	2562	2385	5462

Source: Ministry of Labour and Manpower.

It is very difficult to assess the effectiveness of the redressal mechanism from the available information. This in turn requires the knowledge regarding the access of emigrant to CWA and the latter's freedom and capacity to negotiate with the host country's institutions and court system. On the one hand it is alleged that it is difficult for a foreigner to enter the labour courts in the Middle East while on the other hand accessibility and readiness of CWA for settlement of emigrants complaints has been reportedly inadequate and sub-standard. It is also claimed that CWA being part of the Diplomatic Mission is hindered to have a free and quick mobility which is subjected to procedures of the host country as specified for diplomatic mission. In addition CWA functions under strict administration of the Head of the Diplomatic Mission which curtails needed autonomy to handle the situation. Competence of CWA's to have a sound analysis of labour market and effectively meet the requirements for complaint settlement has been questioned because of the lack of necessary qualification and background. This smacks of favouritism and non-merit considerations while hiring CWA, a lucrative job.

TRADE UNIONS

The level of unionisation in the country is low wherein a minor fraction of the total labour force is unionised. Only one Million or so are the members of the unions in a country of 37 million labour force. According to some estimates the union membership accounts for 6% of the non-agricultural labour force. Notwithstanding this low level of unionisation the growth in the number of registered unions and membership is impressive. The number of unions rose from 209 in 1947 to 7349 in 1996 with membership registering a growth of 300%

during the same period. It may be noted that the number of trade unions and the membership were the highest during, 1977-78 (Appendix Table 7).

Various factors circumscribe the possible role which trade union can play in extending protection to emigrants within Pakistan and through networking with trade unions of the labour importing countries. Firstly the unions are generally at enterprise level with membership confined to workers of that enterprise. Thus emigrant workers are not members of any union. Even in cases where industry wide unions exist the similar procedures apply. Secondly the fragmented nature of unions precludes any stance at broader level. Enterprise level unions get affiliated with federation of their own choice. At present there are multiplicity of these federations which makes it difficult for unions to have a common approach on collective action.

Efforts made by unions to promote unity in 1980's by formation of Pakistan Trade Union Coordination Committee (PTUCC) were abandoned Pakistan Workers Confederation (PWC) with six affiliates in 1994 was a step in the right direction, though concrete and tangible work relating to issues beyond the enterprise level collective bargaining is yet to be undertaken by PWC. Finally the domestic economic conditions featured by stagnation, labour shedding in the public sector, massive unemployment, casualisation of labour and outsourcing the production by employers have weakened the bargaining position of unions in the country. In addition the trade unions are financially weak.

Still Trade Unions as a collective and unified force can extend assistance to emigrants and those who aspire for emigration. For instance All Pakistan Federation of Trade Unions organised activities, established a separate section for the welfare of migrant workers and also held a seminar in 1997 to consider the measures needed to promote welfare facilities. The intervention of trade unions in the field of emigration can be productive through undertaking activities such as:

1. Complaints Regarding Recruitment Agents. It is well known that some fake or unscrupulous recruiting agents not only extract unduly large amounts from the prospective emigrants but also prepare fake documents. Trade unions can collect such information through creating a special cell and persuade the Ministry for redressal of the workers grievances.
2. The proposed cell may also investigate all the case of the deportation of illegal migrant from abroad to determine the cause of such deportation.
3. Counselling to prospective emigrants on various issues pertaining to job and civil standards of the host country.
4. Net working with trade unions of labour receiving countries to devise means for redressal of worker's grievances, discrimination in salary and non-salary entitlement, and legality of status.

It may be noted that NGO's and trade unions can perform a productive role in the mitigation of emigrant problems. Activities such as provision of information, counselling services, regulation of employment agencies and developing networking capacity. Public Service International (PSI) carried out a number of activities to protect migrant workers. Trade unions, NGO's and other human rights activist can persuade the governments to ratify ILO convention on migrant workers.

SECTION - III

MACRO ECONOMIC CONTEXT AND EMIGRATION PRESSURES

Pakistan's economic performance during the decade of 1990's represents a sharp departure from the past. In contrast to over 5% GDP growth during the first four decades (1947-89) the economy tumbled during 1990's having growth rate of around less than 4%. With the possible exception of livestock sector all the remaining segments of the economy yielded sub-standard growth performance. In particular the growth in large scale manufacturing has been around 3% in contrast to 10% or so in the past. This subdued economic performance can be partly attributed to implementation of IMF/World Bank Stabilisation and Structural Adjustment Programmes undertaken since 1987. Part of the reasons could be the international recessionary conditions particularly East Asian crisis since 1997, frequent changes in the political governments, law and order situation and overall worsening governance.

Under the stabilisation measures, though budget deficit as a fraction of GDP has been reduced to 4.5% from the earlier 7% or so. However, this has been achieved by squeezing the public sector expenditure rather than enhanced revenue generation. Main brunt of this squeeze has been on the development expenditure which declined from 7.5% of GDP in 1991/92 to 3.4% in 1996/97. The investment in the economy therefore grew by 1% during 1993/98 because the private sector failed to fill up the gaps created due to squeeze on public sector development programme. Also there was a decline in net inflow of resources from abroad. Supply side response under the structural adjustments has yet to yield dividends. In fact low protection regime, and liberalisation of interest rate contributed, partly of course, to the generation of the phenomenon of sick industries, which manifested itself in the low manufacturing growth rate and sub-optimal utilisation of the capacity in addition to closure of many units.

Unfortunately the prospects for the medium terms hardly appears bright. Economic growth is yet to be reactivated to extricate the economy from the low level equilibrium trap. Despite positive policy changes exports could not grow beyond 7% in contrast to 8% in 1980's. Neither private saving nor revenue generation has registered commendable growth. With overall decay in the governance structure and stagnant economy foreign direct investment hardly appears to be an option in near future. Below a brief discussion on employment generation during 1990, unemployment and underemployment and likely emigration pressure is made.

Employment and Unemployment During 1990's

Stagnation in economic growth, freeze on government hiring, and labour shedding in public sector, deflationary effect of budgetary measures under Stabilisation and

Structural Adjustment Programmes, and shift in the governmental role wherein job escalation in public sector was no more feasible constitute some of the influencing factors for job creation during 1990's. Employment growth during the 1990's has been outstripped by the labour force growth reflecting a failure to absorb the incremental labour force despite the fact that activity rates remained somewhat unaltered. The crude activity rate was 28% in 1990/91 and 28.6% in 1996/97. Industrial structure of employment exhibited a shift from commodity producing sector to service. In fact there appears to be a de-industrialisation wherein the share of manufacturing in total employment declined from 14.2 in 1986/87 to 11.2 in 1996/97. Services and trade appears to have gained in their relative shares of employment.

The employment generation during the 1990's is indicative of a supply thrust rather the demand induced. For instance one finds that during 1993/94 to 1996/97 labour productivity has declined in all the major sectors of the economy. Also the low productivity sectors were the ones absorbing the incremental labour force as reflected by the table below, thus imparting a negative correlation between employment growth and productivity growth.

Table 7

Employment and Labour Productivity: 1987-94

Industrial Division	1991/92		1993/94		1996/97	
	Productivity	Employment	Productivity	Employment	Productivity	Employment
Agriculture	8372.83	14.98	7566.00	16.52	8573	16.45
Mining & Manufacturing	22651.80	3.88	29191.29	3.34	29010	3.69
Construction	9931.98	1.97	9786.00	2.15	8767	2.53
Transport	27595.91	1.71	32008.00	1.63	30991	1.78
Trade	19351.35	4.07	19748.00	4.22	18344	5.24

Source: GDP and Employment data from Annual Economic Survey, 1996-97.

Note: (1) Employment in Millions

(2) Productivity in terms of GDP at c.f.c 1980/81.

A relative rise in the share of informal sector employment is also yielded by data. Labour Force Survey of 1996/97 indicates a very high proportion of non-agricultural worker engaged in the informal sector. A higher fraction of females in the rural areas is engaged in the informal activities. Similarly a comparative picture of data for early 1990's is suggestive of increased informalisation.

Non-availability of adequate information precludes a quantification of the real wage changes during the 1990's. The Census of Manufacturing Industries, a

major source of data for large scale manufacturing is not available since 1990/91. A patchwork of data reproduced below is reflective of a decline in real wages during 1989-96 period.

Table 8

Real Wages Per Day for Different Categories of Workers
(1980-81 Prices)

Type of Worker	1980-81 Prices	
	Average of 1988 & 1989	Average of 1995 & 1996
Carpenter	60.16	52.80
Mason	59.58	52.40
Unskilled Labour	26.31	25.54
Agriculture		
Permanent Labour		
(a) Kharif	16.60	16.34
(b) Rabi	17.55	17.09
Casual Labour	17.72	19.00

Source: Irfan, Mohammad. (1997). Employment Structure and Wages in Pakistan: Trends in 1990's. Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, Islamabad.

Unemployment and Under Employment

Open unemployment rate, admittedly not an adequate indicator in the developing world, is reflective of a worsening situation in the labour market (see Table 9 below). Unemployment rate (6%) yielded by 1996/97 Labour Force Survey (LFS) is almost twice that of 1986/87. The unemployment rate reported for urban areas is higher than that of rural areas. Similarly teenagers and female suffer from higher level of unemployment than the remaining categories. In terms of education level one finds that illiterate and those with pre-matric education level display a lower unemployment rate than those with matric and higher level of education.

Underemployment defined to be working less than 35 hours during the week preceding the conduct of the labour force survey seemingly remained constant. Underemployment ranged between 10% for 1986/87 to 11.5% in 1996/97. Underemployment generally has a higher level of incidence in rural areas than in urban areas. Similarly a larger fraction of female particularly those who are engaged as unpaid family helper suffer from underemployment more than their counterparts.

Table 9

Unemployment and Underemployment Rates, 1968/69 to 1996/97

Period	Unemployment Rate			Underemployment Rate
	All Areas	Rural	Urban	Working Less than 35 hours/week – all areas
1968/69	2.1	1.7	3.5	14.0
1969/70	2.0	1.8	2.9	8.3
1970/71	1.8	1.4	3.0	7.2
1971/72	2.0	1.7	3.7	8.4
1974/75	1.7	1.3	2.7	4.8
1978/79	3.5	3.0	5.2	13.0
1982/83	3.9	3.3	5.8	14.0
1984/85	3.7	2.9	5.7	9.2
1985/86	3.6	3.1	5.0	9.4
1986/87	3.1	2.5	4.5	10.0
1992/93	4.7	4.3	5.8	12.8
1993/94	4.8	4.2	6.5	13.2
1994/95	5.4	4.8	6.9	12.2
1996/97	6.1	5.7	7.2	11.5

Source: Labour Force Surveys.

It may be highlighted that open unemployment rate based on labour force survey is an imperfect proxy of labour utilisation. A closer scrutiny of the data contained in 1994/95 LFS is reported in Table 10. Non-participation in labour force is rather esoteric for professionals and degree holders particularly in case of females.

Table 10

Inactivity Rates of Graduates by Discipline: 1993/95

Graduates	1993/94			1994/95		
	Both	Male	Female	Both	Male	Female
Engineers	21	12	66	13.6	10.5	33
Medical Doctors	11	-	50	12.5	14.3	50
All other Graduates	33	17	76	32.6	15.6	71
Post Graduates	18	9	10	17.0	6.0	56

Source: Labour Force Surveys.

For instance 71% female graduates and 50% medical doctors opted to be outside the labour force. In case of postgraduate females the percentage came to 56%. Given that tertiary level of education is highly subsidised such a level of inactivity raises serious equity and efficiency concerns.

An additional interesting finding of the L.F.S. pertains to the unrealistic preference structure of the unemployed. For instance around two thirds of the unemployed would like to have a full time job with the government, a proportion twice the current governmental share in the total employment. Most of the educated (Matric and above) would prefer to have a white collar job while only 1% of the unemployed covered by 1993/94 LFS preferred to have a job as agriculturist.

EMIGRATION PRESSURES

Notwithstanding the fact that the export of labour whether unskilled or skilled and educated can hardly be regarded as unmixed blessing, the supply pressures alongwith subdued economic performance of the country and depressed economic conditions indicate a vast potential and resultant emigration pressures. As discussed above unemployment rate has risen during the past decade. The role of the state in employment generation is drastically curtailed under the new economic management.

Unfortunately the future hardly appears promising either. Some projection exercises are reflective of the imperviousness of the existing levels of unemployment even under the optimistic condition of 7% annual growth rate of GDP. An additional disturbing trend being a perceptible shift in the educational composition of the unemployed wherein not only the educated (matric and above) will suffer from higher rate of unemployment than at present but also experience a rise in their relative share of the unemployed. (See Appendix Table 8). Given that substantial fraction of the educated used to be engaged in public sector services in the past which are currently undergoing the downsizing, the absorption of the educated in future is going to be difficult particularly if the commodity producing sectors and non-public services continue to remain absorbers only of unskilled and semi-skilled labour. Also whatever effective policy interventions were made in the past to improve the employment situation may not be feasible or relevant in the totality of policy environments of future.

The labour market conditions at present are suggestive that even under optimistic conditions of GDP growth, the problem of productive use of human resources still remains. Particularly, the unemployment and nonuse of the educated workers will pose a real challenge to the policy-makers in future.

In the context of labour force growing at a little less than 3 percent per year, Pakistan is equipped with a vast potential for emigration, particularly when the

growth of GDP is not likely to attain a respectable level of 6% or so in near future. This is because of the demographic pressures and the squeeze imposed by stabilisation measures with far slower recovery through supply side as envisaged under structural adjustment programmes of IMF/World Bank package. Exactly, what possible shape and composition of this labour outflow alongwith the destination will obtain cannot be specified at present. It may be added that some projection exercises conducted by Planning Commission in connection with formulation of Ninth Five Year Plan (1998-2003) anticipate a rise in the annual outflow of workers from 127 thousands in 1996 to 170 thousands in 2003. Most of this emigration is expected towards Middle East. Given the recent drop in the labour flow to Middle East the projections are going to prove widely off the mark.

SECTION IV

CONCLUDING REMARKS

Notwithstanding the fact that emigration of manpower is not an unmixed blessing the supply pressures alongwith the subdued performance of the economy tend to suggest that a vast potential exists which is likely to be converted into emigration pressures. In addition in the context of globalisation, growth of communication networks and developments in international transport, emigration is viewed by many as a means of escaping poverty, unemployment and other social deprivations experienced in the home country. Admittedly it is hazardous to provide any estimate or even guesstimate pertaining to volume, composition and direction of future emigration streams from Pakistan. However based on the data pertaining to 1990's and economic trends obtained in the different regions of the world some conjectures can be made.

1. Middle East is not likely to absorb major migratory flows from Pakistan because of emergence of unemployment in Middle East and concomitant efforts to substitute expatriates by nationals. Excepting the situation wherein reconstruction activities in Iraq take place hardly is there much scope left to increase the stock of Pakistanis in the Middle East.
2. East Asian economies have successfully weathered the financial crises of 1997. South Korea, Thailand and Malaysia are back on the growth track. The likelihood that Pakistani emigration to this region may rise can hardly be ruled out.
3. Marginal rise in the emigrant traffic to Europe can not be ruled out. However, most of the Pakistani emigrant irrespective of their qualification are likely to end up in unskilled and manual jobs of short duration.
4. Extrapolation of the trends observed during late 1990's inspire confidence that migrant flow to Canada and America will continue for next few years barring some dramatic changes in the economies of the recipient countries.
5. In comparison to emigration pressures the absorptive capacity of the recipient countries is likely to remain insufficient. Thus volume of illegal or calendestin emigration is likely to be inflated in the future.
6. Based on the above conjectures and the emigration trends yielded by the available information on 1990's it appears imperative to recast the existing institutional apparatus to meet diverse challenges. In this context there is desperate need to improve the existing monitoring mechanism, enhance the effectiveness of existing structures for policy formulation and redressal of workers' grievances. These are briefly discussed below.

Monitoring Mechanism

- (a) Excepting the annual placement data pertaining mostly to Middle East, the rest of the manpower exodus, which is a major part of the total outflow, remains unregistered and unrecorded. Most of the emigrant to America and Europe either depart on visit or student visa and subsequently get absorbed in the labour market of the host country. There is a total lack of information regarding these sojourners. Nothing is known about their employment status and legality. Either the information collected by host country has to be meticulously investigated and/or departure and arrival cards of passengers at the Airports have to be matched. Introduction of computer technology seems essential in this respect. For instance Federal Bureau of Statistics conducted Airport Surveys during 1997-98 to assess the type and value of in kind accompanied baggage. One of the major findings of the survey was that two thirds of passengers out of total estimated 1.6 million for the year were working outside Pakistan. Comparison of the arrival with the departure card using passport number as identification can provide some insights regarding the changes in visa from student to job. Similarly other additional procedures can be contemplated.
- (b) Given that stocks of Pakistanis in Middle East did not undergo major expansion while annual placements are taking place. In other words there must have been sizeable return migration from Middle East. There is an urgent need to mount Airport Surveys as well as field surveys to assess the volume of return migrant and to understand the nature of their absorption in the economy.

Institutional Apparatus

Integration and coordination between different structure related with overseas employment currently operating as separate identities needs to be improved. Putting all these such as Bureau of Emigration, Overseas Pakistani Unit and Overseas Employment Corporation under one umbrella may facilitate the achievement of desired level of interaction. Analytical competence of the existing Overseas Pakistani Unit needs to be enhanced through provision of additional qualified staff and elevation of its status.

Workers Grievances and Complaints

Emigrant problems in Pakistan need to be distinguished from those in the host country. Complaints regarding fraudulent and corrupt practices of the recruiting agents with or without the connivance of the government functionaries may be addressed through self regulation of the recruitment industry, and intervention by Trade Unions NGO's and other human rights organisation. Also appropriate

deterrent measures may be opted.

Regarding grievances in the host country existing procedures involving CWA have to be made more effective by hiring qualified and experienced personnel. There is a need to assess the extent to which the diplomatic status accorded to CWA constitute an hinderance. Still more autonomy to CWA needs to be granted in matters relating to the dispensation of his duties.

Involving Trade Unions

Workers and Employers Organisation can contribute in the redressal of emigrants complaints as well as other issues related to emigration. Admittedly trade unions in Pakistan suffer from financial weakness, divisiveness and lack of cohesion, still major federations like APFTU can render needed assistance by raising issues and complaints at proper level of authority. In addition the trade unions can develop networking with other unions particularly in those regions such as East Asia Europe, and America to extend protection to emigrants legal as well as illegal. Needed in this context is to understand the factors which sustain huge volume of illegal migrants which are often vulnerable and subjected to discrimination of various types and kinds.

REFERENCES

1. Ahmad, S. Mahmud and S. M. Hasan (1971). Estimation of Brain Drain. Planning Commission, Government of Pakistan.
2. Amjad, R. (1989). 'Economic Impact of Migration to the Middle East on the Major Asian Labour Sending Countries - An Overview', in *To the Gulf and Back: Studies on the Economic Impact of Asian Labour Migration*, ed. R. Amjad, pp. 1-27, New Delhi: ILO-ARTEP.
3. Appleyard, R.T. (1991). *International Migration: Challenge for the Nineties*. International Organisation for Migration (OM).
4. Arif, G.M. (1995). *International Contract Labour Migration and Reintegration of Return Migrants: the Experience of Pakistan*, Unpublished Phd Thesis, The Australian National University, Canberra.
5. Arif, G.M. and M. Irfan (1997). "Population Mobility Across Pakistani Borders: Fifty Years Experience". *The Pakistan Development Review*.
6. Gilani, I. S. (1985). *Citizens Slaves Guest-Workers*, Institute of Policy Studies, Islamabad.
7. Irfan, M. (1986). *Migration and Development in Pakistan: Some Selected Issues*. *The Pakistan Development Review*. Autumn.
8. Irfan, Mohammad (1998). *Skills, HRD and Competitiveness*". PIDE Research Report.
9. Kingsley Davis (1951) *The Population of India and Pakistan*. Princeton University.
10. Sauvy, A (1969). *The Economic and Political Consequences of Selective Migration from One Country to Another*. In F. Bechhofer (ed) *Population Growth and the Brain Drain*, University Press, Edinburgh.
11. Seccombe, I. J. and R.J. Lawless (1986). 'Foreign Workers Dependence in the Gulf, and the International Oil Companies: 1910-50', *International Migration Review*, 20(3): 548-574.
12. Shah, N. M. (1994). *An Overview of Present and Future Emigration Dynamics in South Asia*, *International Migration*, 32(2): 217-268.
13. Stahl, Charles W. & Farooq-i-Azam (1990). "Counting Pakistanis in the Middle East". *Asian and Pacific Population Forum*, East-West Centre.
14. Tinker, Hugh (1974). *A New System of Slavery: The Export of Indian Labour Overseas*. 1830-1920. Oxford University Press, London.
15. United Nations (UN) (1979). *Trends and Characteristics of International Migration Since 1950*, Demographic Studies No. 64 New York.

Appendix Table 1

Pakistanis in the United Kingdom 1961-81

Census Year	Number	% Born in UK	% Males
1961	31900	NA	82.0
1972	169700	24.4	67.4
1981	295461	40.0	54.6

Source: UN, (1979); Anwar, 1986; Jeffery, 1976

Appendix Table 2

Statement Showing Pakistanis Who Left Abroad for Higher Studies/Jobs During 1961-1966

Countries	Students	Workers		
		All	Medical	Engineer
UK	3364	1100	1100	0.0
USA	837	1054	30	5
West Germany	113	7	4	1
Libya	0	276	173	100
Canada	98	81	29	12
Saudi Arabia	42	6000	1068	26
Other Countries	118	171	42	46
Total	4572	8689	2446	190

Source: Ahmed and Hasan (1970)

Appendix Table 3

Year/Country Wise Emigration From Pakistan 1971-1999

Years	Saudi Arabia	U.A.E	Oman	Qatar	Kuwait	Bahrain	Iraq	Others	Total
1971	937	529	1215	174	39	478	-	162	3534
1972	788	806	1258	132	42	325	1	1178	4530
1973	1306	3929	1156	446	14	1114	25	4312	12300
1974	1211	7713	3806	344	94	906	53	2201	16326
1975	1338	7255	6651	1750	109	2271	502	3201	23077
1976	18460	10784	3123	590	179	1552	1318	5684	41690
1977	47349	39500	18545	3302	4890	5523	1719	19694	140528
1978	51381	28280	14591	2235	4541	3594	3152	22751	130525
1979	70698	17882	10771	1721	4634	2603	6369	10829	125507
1980	80124	16639	7839	1294	4388	2113	7821	9629	129847
1981	85339	26058	12063	2450	4156	2494	21809	14034	168403
1982	82035	21165	9236	4735	3180	3569	16998	2027	142945
1983	79997	16168	11007	4582	6529	4236	4270	1427	128206
1984	66680	15013	9114	1872	1357	2805	2529	1037	100407
1985	53870	16503	8938	2239	2067	2881	856	1107	88463
1986	29992	17467	7001	2485	1893	1793	1294	643	62568
1987	35846	16870	7489	2524	3589	2074	768	459	69619
1988	49718	20313	7462	2203	976	2491	1118	559	84840
1989	59520	21617	8787	1774	1225	3071	1563	1128	98687
1990	79435	20083	8364	1367	1338	2516	2076	341	115520
1991	113291	15286	9947	1471	4083	2741	40	485	147344
1992	137694	23816	11664	1935	16812	3551	-	621	196093
1993	99027	28347	6511	1263	18940	2013	-	1632	157733
1994	70444	28750	4248	1492	6124	1735	-	1247	114040
1995	77373	28681	9334	632	3898	1424	10	1268	122620
1996	79036	30851	3724	1453	5574	1583	-	5563	127784
1997	78982	39823	4809	2528	4748	1212	-	1827	153929
1998	44667	44761	2713	2070	3851	2102	-	3880	104044
1999 (Jan-June)	11082	33763	1084	1301	2525	985	-	842	41582

Source: Bureau of Emigration (unpublished).

Appendix Table 4

Share of Pakistani Workers in the Annual Placement of
South Asian Workers in the Middle East

Year	Annual Placement of South Asian Workers in the Middle East	Percentage Share of Pakistan
1977	191,000	73.2
1978	237,800	54.0
1979	340,000	34.7
1980	411,600	28.2
1981	530,700	28.5
1982	437,900	31.4
1983	402,200	29.7
1984	366,100	25.5
1985	329,800	25.0
1986	246,100	23.5
1987	273,500	24.2
1988	333,200	24.4
1989	332,700	29.7
1990	398,400	29.0
1991	557,900	26.4
1992	889,900	21.4
1993	869,900	17.7
1994	720,800	15.4

Source: Mahmood (1995); Sasikumar (1995); Yapa (1995)

Appendix Table 5

Occupational Composition of Pakistani Workers in the
Middle East, 1977-1996

Year	Professional Workers	Service Workers	Production Workers	Other Workers	All
1977	7.8	8.8	68.3	15.1	100
1979	6.0	10.4	71.8	11.8	100
1980	5.1	9.7	68.1	17.1	100
1981	5.9	10.4	70.2	13.5	100
1982	6.9	13.3	71.5	8.3	100
1983	7.8	14.6	66.9	10.6	100
1984	6.8	16.5	64.7	12.0	100
1985	6.6	18.5	64.4	10.5	100
1986	8.1	18.9	59.5	13.5	100
1987	8.3	19.1	59.7	12.9	100
1988	8.3	21.2	58.8	11.6	100
1989	9.7	21.8	60.3	8.2	100
1990	9.5	21.3	63.2	6.0	100
1991	8.6	19.1	68.3	4.0	100
1992	10.3	19.7	66.5	3.5	100
1993	6.9	20.2	62.3	10.7	100
1994	6.9	19.2	64.8	9.1	100
1995	6.2	19.7	62.7	11.4	100
1996	7.1	19.7	60.0	13.2	100

Source: Unpublished data from the Bureau of Emigration

Appendix Table 6

Information Sought from Embassies

	Adult	Children	Total
--	-------	----------	-------

- (i) (a) Total number of Pakistanis
 (b) Male
 (c) Female

- (ii) Total number of working Pakistanis
 (a) Male
 (b) Female

- (iii) Problems faced by pakistanis (use separate sheet if required)

- (iv) Proposed Solution: _____

Appendix Table 7

Registered Trade Unions with Membership (All Pakistan)

Year	Number of Unions	Membership
1951	209	3,93,137
1960	708	3,50,604
1970	2,522	7,35,620
1977	8,332	10,50,788
1978	7,894	10,13,097
1980	6,551	8,69,699
1990	7,080	9,52,488
1996	7,349	10,10,679

Source: Provincial Labour Directorates.

Appendix Table 8

Projected Unemployment Rate by Educational Level (Projection)

(In Percentage)

Period	Level of Education					
	Illit.	Pre.Mat.	Matric	Inter.	Degree+	Total
Scenario 1						
1998/99	5.44	6.07	7.9	8.4	9.0	6.2
1999/20	5.26	5.91	7.6	8.3	9.2	6.1
2002/03	4.71	5.43	6.8	8.05	9.8	5.7
2009/10	3.40	4.17	4.6	7.3	11.0	4.8
Scenario 2						
1998/99	7.6	8.2	10.0	10.5	11.1	8.4
1999/20	8.0	8.6	10.3	11.0	11.8	8.8
2002/03	9.1	9.8	11.0	12.3	13.9	10.0
2009/10	11.5	12.2	12.6	15.1	18.5	12.8
Scenario 3						
1998/99	8.1	8.7	10.5	10.9	11.5	8.8
1999/20	8.6	9.2	10.9	11.5	12.4	9.4
2002/03	10.0	10.7	11.9	13.2	14.8	10.9
2009/10	13.1	13.9	14.3	16.7	20.0	14.4
Scenario 4						
2009/10 (a)	-2.7	-1.7	-1.3	1.6	5.5	-1.11
2009/10 (b)	3.4	4.2	4.6	7.3	11.0	4.8

Source:

Scenario I = Availability of manpower increases at 2.77% while GDP = 7% elasticity = 0.42

II = Availability at 2.77, GDP 7% and elasticity = 0.33

III = Availability at 2.77, GDP = 5.24% and elasticity = 0.42

IV = (a) Relevant only for 2009/10 where labour force growth declines from 2.77 to 2.00 with GDP growth of 7% and elasticity = 0.42.

(b) Labour force growth constant at 2.77.